

2023
NATURAL GAS PIPELINE
INDUSTRY
CAPITALIZATION RATE
STUDY



© 2003 Steven Whipple

Prepared by Bruce Nielsen, CPA
Nielsen Management Services, LLC

**CAPITALIZATION RATE STUDY
as of January 01, 2023**

LIST OF EXHIBITS

	<u>EXHIBIT #</u>
LIST OF EXHIBITS	F-1
CAPITALIZATION RATE CALCULATION	F-2
MARKET CAPITAL STRUCTURE	F-3
CAPITAL STRUCTURE	
SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES \$	F-4
SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES %	F-5
ESTIMATED MARKET COST OF DEBT	F-6
CURRENT BOND YIELDS	
MERGENT (MOODY'S) CORPORATE BOND YIELDS	F-7
BLOOMBERG CORPORATE BOND YIELDS	F-8
S&P BOND YIELDS	F-9
SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES - CORPORATE DEBT	
MERGENT (MOODY'S) RATINGS & YIELDS	F-10
S&P RATINGS, BLOOMBERG YIELDS	F-11
S&P RATINGS, S&P YIELDS	F-12
COST OF COMMON EQUITY - SUMMARY	F-13
SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANY'S MODELS	
CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL (EX POST)	F-14
CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL (EX ANTE)	F-15
BUILD-UP MODEL	F-16
DISCOUNTED CASH FLOW MODEL	F-17
VALUE LINE INFORMATION DATA	F-18
FERC "TWO STAGE" DCF MODEL	F-19
FLOATATION COSTS	
FLOATION COST SUMMARY	F-20
FLOTATION COST DATA	F-21, F-22

CAPITALIZATION RATE CALCULATION
as of January 01, 2023

	<u>CAPITAL STRUCTURE</u>	<u>COST (YIELD)</u>	<u>FLOATATION COST</u>	<u>ADJ. COST OF CAPITAL</u>	<u>WEIGHTED COST</u>
DEBT	36.00%	6.20%	1.60%	6.28%	2.26%
PREFERRED	N/A	N/A			N/A
COMMON	<u>64.00%</u>	<u>18.35%</u>	2.60%	18.84%	<u>12.06%</u>
	100.00%	13.97%			14.32%

SELECTED CAPITALIZATION RATE

14.30%

**MARKET CAPITAL STRUCTURE
12/30/2022**

CURRENT YEAR ACTUAL	DEBT	EQUITY
----------------------------	-------------	---------------

SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES

AVERAGE	38.27%	61.74%
WEIGHTED AVERAGE	41.49%	58.51%
MEDIAN	35.92%	64.08%

PRIOR YEAR ESTIMATED PERCENT EQUITY		63.00%
--	--	---------------

	DEBT	PREF.	EQUITY
ESTIMATED MARKET* CAPITAL STRUCTURE	36.00%	0.00%	64.00%

* "The company cost of capital is the expected rate of return that investors demand from the company's assets and operations. Therefore, it must be based on what investors are actually willing to pay for the company's outstanding securities--that is, based on the securities' market value."
 "Fundamentals of Corporate Finance", Richard A. Brealey, Stewart C. Myers, and Alan J. Marcus, McGraw-Hill Co. 1995, p.279

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES \$
CAPITAL STRUCTURE (VALUE LINE DATA)**

COMPANY NAME	L.T. DEBT	PREFERRED STOCK	COMMON STOCK @ MKT. VALUE
Cheniere Energy Part.	15,699.00	0.00	28,088.09
Enbridge Inc.	74,000.00	7,747.00	107,152.42
Energy Transfer LP	47,413.00	0.00	36,659.31
Enterprise Products	26,548.00	0.00	52,497.18
Kinder Morgan Inc.	29,107.00	0.00	40,674.58
National Fuel Gas	2,082.50	0.00	5,791.95
ONEOK Inc.	11,950.70	0.00	29,361.33
Pembina Pipeline	8,976.00	2,424.00	25,351.54
TC Energy Corp.	37,617.50	1,823.50	40,338.32
Williams Cos.	22,530.00	0.00	40,072.20
TOTAL	27,592.37	1,199.45	40,598.69

Source: Value Line, CD ROM

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES %
CAPITAL STRUCTURE (VALUE LINE DATA)**

COMPANY NAME	L.T. DEBT	PREFERRED STOCK	COMMON STOCK @ MKT. VALUE	
Cheniere Energy Part.	35.85%	0.00%	64.15%	
Enbridge Inc.	39.17%	4.10%	56.73%	
Energy Transfer LP	56.40%	0.00%	43.60%	
Enterprise Products	33.59%	0.00%	66.41%	
Kinder Morgan Inc.	41.71%	0.00%	58.29%	
National Fuel Gas	26.45%	0.00%	73.55%	
ONEOK Inc.	28.93%	0.00%	71.07%	
Pembina Pipeline	24.42%	6.60%	68.98%	
TC Energy Corp.	47.15%	2.29%	50.56%	
Williams Cos.	35.99%	0.00%	64.01%	
	AVERAGE	36.97%	1.30%	61.74%
	WEIGHTED AVERAGE	39.76%	1.73%	58.51%
	MEDIAN	35.92%	0.00%	64.08%

Source: Value Line, CD ROM

ESTIMATED MARKET COST OF DEBT

SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES

AVERAGE MERGENT (MOODY'S) PIPELINE INDUSTRY	6.10%	
AVERAGE BLOOMBERG PIPELINE INDUSTRY	6.23%	
AVERAGE STANDARD & POORS PIPELINE INDUSTRY	N/A	6.17%

ESTIMATED COST OF DEBT 6.20%

**CORPORATE BOND YIELD AVERAGES
MERGENT (MOODY'S) CORPORATE BOND YIELDS**

"Ba" Rated

**RATE IN
PERCENT**

YEAR END

Ba1	6.97%
Ba2	6.97%
Ba3	6.97%

"Baa" Rated

**RATE IN
PERCENT**

YEAR END

Baa1	5.97%
Baa2	5.97%
Baa3	5.97%

"A" Rated

**RATE IN
PERCENT**

YEAR END

A1	5.48%
A2	5.48%
A3	5.48%

Source - Mergents Bond Record & S&P Database, January 2023

**CORPORATE BOND YIELD AVERAGES
BLOOMBERG CORPORATE BOND YIELDS**

"BB" Rated

RATE IN
PERCENT

YEAR END

BB+	7.65%
BB	11.63%
BB-	8.59%

"BBB" Rated

RATE IN
PERCENT

YEAR END

BBB+	5.87%
BBB	6.30%
BBB-	6.61%

"A" Rated

RATE IN
PERCENT

YEAR END

A+	5.61%
A	5.59%
A-	5.93%

Source - Bloomberg Data Base, 20 Year Maturity, January-2023

**CORPORATE BOND YIELD AVERAGES
S&P BOND YIELDS**

"BB" Rated

RATE IN
PERCENT

YEAR END

BB+

N/A

BB

N/A

BB-

N/A

"BBB" Rated

RATE IN
PERCENT

YEAR END

BBB+

N/A

BBB

N/A

BBB-

N/A

"A" Rated

RATE IN
PERCENT

YEAR END

A+

N/A

A

N/A

A-

N/A

Source - Standard & Poors Data from Mergent Bond Record Database, January-2023

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
CURRENT COST OF CORPORATE DEBT**

MERGENT (MOODY'S) RATINGS & YIELDS

COMPANY NAME	MERGENT BOND RATINGS	MERGENT BOND YIELDS
Cheniere Energy Part.	Ba1	6.97%
Enbridge Inc.	Baa1	5.97%
Energy Transfer LP	Baa3	5.97%
Enterprise Products	n/a	N/A
Kinder Morgan Inc.	Baa2	5.97%
National Fuel Gas	Baa3	5.97%
ONEOK Inc.	Baa3	5.97%
Pembina Pipeline	n/a	N/A
TC Energy Corp.	Baa2	5.97%
Williams Cos.	Baa2	5.97%
	AVERAGE	6.10%

Source - Mergents Bond Record & S&P Database, January 2023

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
CURRENT COST OF CORPORATE DEBT**

S&P RATINGS, BLOOMBERG YIELDS

COMPANY NAME	S&P BOND RATINGS	BLOOMBERG BOND YIELDS
Cheniere Energy Part.	BBB	6.30%
Enbridge Inc.	BBB+	5.87%
Energy Transfer LP	BBB-	6.61%
Enterprise Products	BBB+	5.87%
Kinder Morgan Inc.	BBB	6.30%
National Fuel Gas	BBB-	6.61%
ONEOK Inc.	BBB	6.30%
Pembina Pipeline	BBB	6.30%
TC Energy Corp.	BBB+	5.87%
Williams Cos.	BBB	6.30%
	AVERAGE	6.23%

Source - Bloomberg Data Base, 20 Year Maturity, January-2023

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
CURRENT COST OF CORPORATE DEBT**

S&P RATINGS, S&P YIELDS

COMPANY NAME	S&P BOND RATINGS	S&P BOND YIELDS
Cheniere Energy Part.	BBB	N/A
Enbridge Inc.	BBB+	N/A
Energy Transfer LP	BBB-	N/A
Enterprise Products	BBB+	N/A
Kinder Morgan Inc.	BBB	N/A
National Fuel Gas	BBB-	N/A
ONEOK Inc.	BBB	N/A
Pembina Pipeline	BBB	N/A
TC Energy Corp.	BBB+	N/A
Williams Cos.	BBB	N/A
	AVERAGE	N/A

Source - Standard & Poors Data from Mergent Bond Record Database, January-2023

COST OF COMMON EQUITY - SUMMARY

MODEL USED

PERCENT

CALCULATED MODELS BASED ON SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES

CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL (EX POST)	12.43%
CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL (EX ANTE)	14.52%
DISCOUNTED CASH FLOW MODEL	19.84%
FERC "TWO STAGE" DCF MODEL	16.90%
BUILD-UP MODEL	13.24%
AVERAGE ALL	15.39%

SELECTED EQUITY RATE

18.35%

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL (EX POST)**

ITEM	RATE
<p>LONG TERM EXPECTED EQUITY RISK PREMIUM: LARGE COMPANY STOCK TOTAL RETURNS MINUS LONG TERM GOVERNMENT BOND INCOME RETURNS. <i>(KROLL 2022 CRSP DECILES SIZE PREMIA STUDY, "KEY VARIABLES IN ESTIMATING THE COST OF CAPITAL")</i></p>	7.17%
RISK ADJUSTMENT FACTOR (Beta)	1.07
ADJUSTED RISK PREMIUM	7.67%
<p>LONG TERM GOVERNMENT BONDS @ 12/31/22 <i>(ST. LOUIS FEDERAL RESERVE - 20YR LT GOVERNMENT BONDS AS FOUND ON THE ST. LOUIS FEDERAL RESERVE WEBSITE)</i></p>	4.14%
LARGE COMPANY ESTIMATED EQUITY YIELD RATE	11.81%
<p>ADJUSTMENT FOR SIZE PREMIUM* FOR QUANTIFICATION OF SIZE PREMIUM SEE: <i>(KROLL 2022 CRSP DECILES SIZE PREMIA STUDY, "KEY VARIABLES IN ESTIMATING THE COST OF CAPITAL")</i></p>	0.62%
COST OF EQUITY CAPITAL	12.43%

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL (EX ANTE)**

ITEM	RATE
WEIGHTED AVERAGE COST OF EQUITY FOR S&P 500 S&P 500 EXPECTED EQUITY COST MINUS LONG TERM GOVERNMENT BOND INCOME RETURNS. <i>(STANDARD & POOR'S COMPUSTAT & I/B/E/S (S&P 500))</i>	9.12%
RISK ADJUSTMENT FACTOR (Beta)	<u>1.07</u>
ADJUSTED RISK PREMIUM	9.76%
LONG TERM GOVERNMENT BONDS @ 12/31/22 <i>(ST. LOUIS FEDERAL RESERVE - 20YR LT GOVERNMENT BONDS AS FOUND ON THE ST. LOUIS FEDERAL RESERVE WEBSITE)</i>	<u>4.14%</u>
LARGE COMPANY ESTIMATED EQUITY YIELD RATE	13.90%
ADJUSTMENT FOR SIZE PREMIUM* FOR QUANTIFICATION OF SIZE PREMIUM SEE: <i>(KROLL 2022 CRSP DECILES SIZE PREMIA STUDY, "KEY VARIABLES IN ESTIMATING THE COST OF CAPITAL")</i>	<u>0.62%</u>
COST OF EQUITY CAPITAL	14.52%

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
BUILD-UP MODEL**

CALCULATION OF IMPLIED COST OF EQUITY	RATE
CURRENT COST OF CORPORATE DEBT @ 1/1/2023 (See Exhibit F-6)	6.20%
AVERAGE RISK PREMIUM - COMMON STOCKS OVER AAA & AA CORPORATE BONDS <i>(KROLL 2022 CRSP DECILES SIZE PREMIA STUDY, "KEY VARIABLES IN ESTIMATING THE COST OF CAPITAL")</i>	7.17%
BETWEEN AAA & Baa BONDS	<u>0.75%</u>
ADJUSTED RISK PREMIUM LESS ADJUSTMENT FOR DIFFERENTIAL IMPLIED COST OF EQUITY	<u>6.42%</u> 12.62%
ADJUSTMENT FOR SIZE PREMIUM FOR QUANTIFICATION OF SIZE PREMIUM SEE: <i>(KROLL 2022 CRSP DECILES SIZE PREMIA STUDY, "KEY VARIABLES IN ESTIMATING THE COST OF CAPITAL")</i>	<u>0.62%</u>
COST OF EQUITY USING SIZE PREMIUM	13.24%

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
DISCOUNTED CASH FLOW MODEL**

COMPANY NAME	PROJECTED GROWTH IN EARNINGS	EXPECTED DIVIDEND YIELD	EST. COST OF EQUITY
Cheniere Energy Part.	9.50%	6.36%	15.86%
Enbridge Inc.	10.00%	6.91%	16.91%
Energy Transfer LP	10.00%	9.29%	19.29%
Enterprise Products	7.00%	8.85%	15.85%
Kinder Morgan Inc.	19.00%	6.54%	25.54%
National Fuel Gas	25.00%	3.12%	28.12%
ONEOK Inc.	11.50%	6.44%	17.94%
Pembina Pipeline	20.00%	5.91%	25.91%
TC Energy Corp.	8.00%	7.57%	15.57%
Williams Cos.	12.00%	5.43%	17.43%
AVERAGE	13.20%	6.64%	19.84%
DCF COST OF EQUITY CAPITAL			19.84%

Source: Value Line, CD ROM

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
VALUE LINE INFORMATION DATA**

COMPANY NAME	BETA	SAFETY	FINANCIAL STRENGTH
Cheniere Energy Part.	0.95	3.00	7.00
Enbridge Inc.	0.85	2.00	4.00
Energy Transfer LP	1.15	3.00	5.00
Enterprise Products	1.05	3.00	4.00
Kinder Morgan Inc.	1.15	3.00	6.00
National Fuel Gas	0.85	3.00	5.00
ONEOK Inc.	1.45	3.00	5.00
Pembina Pipeline	1.05	3.00	4.00
TC Energy Corp.	1.05	3.00	4.00
Williams Cos.	1.15	3.00	6.00
AVERAGE	1.07	2.90	5.00
RELATIVE VALUE LINE SAFETY RANKING			0.97
RELATIVE VALUE LINE FINANCIAL STRENGTH			1.00
SELECTED VALUE LINE BETA			1.07

Source: Value Line, CD ROM

**SELECTED COMPARABLE COMPANIES
FERC "TWO STAGE" DCF MODEL**

LONG TERM (STAGE TWO) ESTIMATES

COMPANY NAME	GDP REAL GROWTH	ANNUAL INFLATION	DIVIDEND YIELD	COST OF EQUITY
Cheniere Energy Part.	2.02%	2.35%	6.36%	10.73%
Enbridge Inc.	2.02%	2.35%	6.91%	11.28%
Energy Transfer LP	2.02%	2.35%	9.29%	13.66%
Enterprise Products	2.02%	2.35%	8.85%	13.22%
Kinder Morgan Inc.	2.02%	2.35%	6.54%	10.91%
National Fuel Gas	2.02%	2.35%	3.12%	7.49%
ONEOK Inc.	2.02%	2.35%	6.44%	10.81%
Pembina Pipeline	2.02%	2.35%	5.91%	10.28%
TC Energy Corp.	2.02%	2.35%	7.57%	11.94%
Williams Cos.	2.02%	2.35%	5.43%	9.80%
AVERAGE	2.02%	2.35%	6.64%	11.01%
AVERAGE STAGE TWO ESTIMATE WEIGHTED @ 1/3			11.01%	3.67%
AVERAGE STAGE ONE ESTIMATE (FROM EXHIBIT F-17) WEIGHTED AT 2/3			19.84%	<u>13.23%</u>
TWO STAGE COST OF EQUITY CAPITAL				16.90%

Source: Value Line, CD ROM

NATURAL GAS AND LIQUID PIPELINES

2023 Capitalization Rate Study

for Natural Gas and Liquid Pipeline Operating Property

FLOTATION COSTS

	Rate	Divisor
For Long Term Debt	1.60%	98.78%
For Common Stock	2.60%	97.40%

The common definitions of market value all assume a sale of the subject property, which implies the existence of a market.

Appraisal Institute, *The Appraisal of Real Estate*, 14th ed., (Chicago, IL: 2013), p. 380.

To demonstrate the need for adjusting the market-determined return on equity for flotation costs, consider the following simple example. Shareholders invest \$100 of capital on which they expect to earn a return of 10% or \$10, but the company nets \$95 because of issuance costs. It is obvious that the company will have to earn more than 10% on its net book investment (rate base) of \$95 to provide investors with a \$10 return on the money actually invested. To provide the same earnings of \$10 on a reduced capital base of \$95 clearly requires a return higher than the shareholder expected return of 10%, namely $\$10/\$95=10.53\%$. This is because only the net proceeds from an equity issue are used to add to the rate base on which the investor earns.

Morin, Roger A., *Regulatory Finance, Utilities Cost of Capital*, (Arlington, VA: Public Utilities Reports, Inc., 1994), p. 166.

Flotation costs occur when new issues of stock or debt are sold to the public. The firm usually incurs several kinds of flotation or transaction costs, which reduces the actual proceeds received by the firm. Some of these are direct out-of-pocket outlays, such as fees paid to underwriters, legal expenses, and prospectus preparation costs. Because of this reduction in proceeds, the firm's required returns on these proceeds equate to a higher return to compensate for the additional costs. Flotation costs can be accounted for either by amortizing the cost, thus reducing the cash flow to discount, or by incorporating the cost into the cost of capital. Because flotation costs are not typically applied to operating cash flow, one must incorporate them into the cost of capital.

Pratt, Shannon P., *Cost of Capital, Estimation and Applications*, (New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc. 1998) p. 176.

When new shares are sold to the public, the firm usually incurs several kinds of flotation or transaction costs...These costs may be incorporated into investment decisions in two ways. Assume that the total costs are a fraction, F, of the price, P₀, of the shares in the absence of the issue. The first method is to incorporate the total dollar transaction costs, FP₀, as a negative cash flow in the computation of the initial cost of the investment, C₀, when carrying out a net present value (NPV) analysis. The second method is to incorporate the costs directly into the discount rate applicable to the future cash flow stream...

Patterson, Cleveland S., *The Cost of Capital, Theory and Estimation*, (Westport, CT: Quorum Books, 1995), p. 27.

Note: Divisor for Debt = $100\% - (1.60\% \times 76.00\%) = 98.78\%$
 Divisor for Equity = $100\% - 2.60\% = 97.40\%$

**Natural Gas and Liquid Pipelines
2023 Capitalization Rate Study
for Natural Gas and Liquid Pipeline Operating Property**

ISSUANCE COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH COMMON STOCK

Issuer	Prospectus Date	Common Shares	Price to Public	Gross Proceeds to Issuer	Issuance Costs			Net Proceeds to Issuer	Issuance Cost %
					Underwriting	Other Exp.*	Total		
		a	b	c (a x b)	d	e	f (d + e)	g (c - f)	h (c - g) ÷ c
1 Williams Companies	01/11/17	65,000,000	\$ 29.00	\$1,885,000,000	\$ 42,412,500	\$ 500,000	\$42,912,500	\$1,842,087,500	2.28%
2 Williams Companies	07/17/14	53,000,000	\$ 57.00	\$3,021,000,000	\$ 83,077,500	\$ 500,000	\$83,577,500	\$2,937,422,500	2.77%
3 Enterprise Products	12/16/20	117,850,000	\$ 21.54	\$2,538,489,000	\$ 50,769,780	\$ 500,000	\$51,269,780	\$2,487,219,220	2.02%
4 Magellan Midstream	05/04/17	10,200,000	\$ 73.53	\$ 750,006,000	\$ 15,000,000	\$ 250,000	\$15,250,000	\$ 734,756,000	2.03%
5 ONEOK	07/01/20	33,355,570	\$ 29.98	\$1,000,000,000	\$ 20,000,000	\$ 129,800	\$20,129,800	\$ 979,870,200	2.01%
6 ONEOK	06/15/20	26,000,000	\$ 32.00	\$ 832,000,000	\$ 16,640,000	\$ 650,000	\$17,290,000	\$ 814,710,000	2.08%
7 Plains All American	12/01/16	25,286,581	\$ 29.66	\$ 750,000,000	\$ 15,000,000	\$ -	\$15,000,000	\$ 735,000,000	2.00%
8 Western Midstream	06/05/15	2,000,000	\$ 58.20	\$ 116,400,000	\$ 3,492,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 3,692,000	\$ 112,708,000	3.17%
9 MDU Resources	02/22/19	3,800,000	\$ 39.50	\$ 150,100,000	\$ 4,864,000	\$ 400,000	\$ 5,264,000	\$ 144,836,000	3.51%
10 National Fuel Gas	05/29/20	22,000,000	\$ 12.90	\$ 283,800,000	\$ 9,933,000	\$ 390,000	\$10,323,000	\$ 273,477,000	3.64%
11 Energy Transfer	12/09/21	86,956,522	\$ 7.65	\$ 665,217,393	\$ 13,319,448	\$ 350,000	\$13,669,448	\$ 651,547,945	2.05%
12 NuStar Energy	09/06/12	6,200,000	\$ 48.94	\$ 303,428,000	\$ 10,163,800	\$ 300,000	\$10,463,800	\$ 292,964,200	3.45%
Average (rounded)								2.60%	

* Estimates of non underwriting related expenses are separately disclosed within each prospectus.

1 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/107263/000119312517007791/d328429d424b2.htm>
2 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/107263/000119312514241120/d741999d424b2.htm>
3 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1061219/000119312520319100/d62136d424b5.htm>
4 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1126975/000119312517158943/d388676d424b5.htm>
5 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1039684/000119312520198030/d42955d424b5.htm>
6 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1039684/000119312520167930/d942884d424b5.htm>

7 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1070423/000104746916017004/a2230414z424b5.htm>
8 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1423902/000119312515215121/d936291d424b3.htm>
9 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/67716/000104746919000625/a2237776z424b5.htm>
10 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/70145/000119312520155803/d930575d424b2.htm>
11 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1276187/000119312521352652/d161044d424b7.htm>
12 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1110805/000104746912008699/a2210938z424b5.htm>

**Natural Gas and Liquid Pipelines
2023 Capitalization Rate Study
for Natural Gas and Liquid Pipeline Operating Property**

ISSUANCE COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH NATURAL GAS AND LIQUID PIPELINES LONG-TERM DEBT (LIMITED TO 30 YEAR BONDS)

Issuer	Prospectus Date	Gross Bond Issue	Price to Public	Gross Proceeds to Issuer	Issuance Costs			Net Proceeds to Issuer	Issuance Cost %
					Underwriting	Other Exp.*	Total		
		a	b	c (a x b)	d	e	f (d + e)	g (c - f)	h (a - g) ÷ a
1 Williams Companies	08/03/22	\$ 750,000,000	0.99954	\$ 749,655,000	\$ 6,562,500	\$1,714,286	\$ 8,276,786	\$ 741,378,214	1.15%
2 Williams Companies	10/07/21	\$ 650,000,000	0.99833	\$ 648,914,500	\$ 5,687,500	\$1,300,000	\$ 6,987,500	\$ 641,927,000	1.24%
3 Williams Companies	06/20/14	\$ 650,000,000	0.99773	\$ 648,524,500	\$ 5,687,500	\$ 171,053	\$ 5,858,553	\$ 642,665,947	1.13%
4 Enbridge Inc	06/25/21	\$ 500,000,000	0.99754	\$ 498,769,924	\$ 4,375,000	\$ 179,582	\$ 4,554,582	\$ 494,215,342	1.16%
5 Enbridge Inc	11/14/19	\$ 500,000,000	0.98845	\$ 494,224,924	\$ 4,375,000	\$ 73,750	\$ 4,448,750	\$ 489,776,174	2.04%
6 Enterprise Products	09/08/21	\$1,000,000,000	0.99170	\$ 991,700,000	\$ 8,750,000	\$1,780,000	\$10,530,000	\$ 981,170,000	1.88%
7 Enterprise Products	01/07/20	\$1,000,000,000	0.99413	\$ 994,130,000	\$ 8,750,000	\$1,566,667	\$10,316,667	\$ 983,813,333	1.62%
8 Kinder Mirgan	07/25/22	\$ 750,000,000	0.99634	\$ 747,255,000	\$ 5,625,000	\$3,500,000	\$ 9,125,000	\$ 738,130,000	1.58%
9 Kinder Mirgan	02/09/21	\$ 750,000,000	0.99744	\$ 748,080,000	\$ 5,625,000	\$2,000,000	\$ 7,625,000	\$ 740,455,000	1.27%
10 MP:X	08/10/22	\$1,500,000,000	0.98982	\$1,484,730,000	\$ 13,125,000	\$4,000,000	\$17,125,000	\$1,467,605,000	2.16%
11 MP:X	11/09/18	\$1,500,000,000	0.98031	\$1,470,465,000	\$ 13,125,000	\$3,333,333	\$16,458,333	\$1,454,006,667	3.07%
12 Magellan Midstream	08/09/19	\$ 500,000,000	0.99910	\$ 499,550,000	\$ 4,375,000	\$ 750,000	\$ 5,125,000	\$ 494,425,000	1.12%
13 Magellan Midstream	01/11/19	\$ 500,000,000	0.99371	\$ 496,855,000	\$ 4,375,000	\$ 750,000	\$ 5,125,000	\$ 491,730,000	1.65%
14 ONEOK	05/06/20	\$ 300,000,000	0.99632	\$ 298,896,000	\$ 2,625,000	\$ 560,000	\$ 3,185,000	\$ 295,711,000	1.43%
15 ONEOK	03/09/20	\$ 100,000,000	0.99125	\$ 99,125,000	\$ 875,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 1,075,000	\$ 98,050,000	1.95%
Average (rounded)								1.60%	

* Estimates of non underwriting related expenses are separately disclosed within each prospectus. In certain instances, these estimated expense amounts were allocated across two bond issues.

- 1 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/107263/000119312522213598/d290801d424b2.htm>
- 2 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/107263/000119312521294160/d148435d424b2.htm>
- 3 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/107263/000119312514243957/d745594d424b2.htm>
- 4 https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/895728/000110465921085731/tm2120459d2_424b5.htm
- 5 https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/895728/000110465919064346/a19-22424_1424b5.htm
- 6 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1061219/000119312521267845/d140078d424b5.htm>
- 7 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1061219/000119312520003028/d101293d424b5.htm>
- 8 https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1506307/000110465922082876/tm2221024-4_424b2.htm

- 9 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1506307/000104746921000326/a2242905z424b2.htm>
- 10 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1552000/000119312522216956/d370207d424b5.htm>
- 11 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1552000/000119312518323034/d651104d424b5.htm>
- 12 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1126975/000119312519217204/d781930d424b2.htm>
- 13 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1126975/000119312519008153/d640796d424b2.htm>
- 14 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1039684/000119312520134064/d899396d424b5.htm>
- 15 <https://www.sec.gov/Archives/edgar/data/1039684/000119312520067360/d848651d424b5.htm>